

# Limitations to Text and Data Mining and Consumer Empowerment: Making the Case for a Right to “Machine Legibility”

## Abstract

The deployment of Artificial Intelligence (AI) applications, based on text and data mining (TDM), is potentially restricted by the current regime of intellectual property rights and the private ordering imposed by many online actors through contracts and technological protection measures.

The paper aims to critically analyse the barriers to TDM and contribute to the discussion on the specific exceptions included in the draft Copyright in the DSM Directive, as amended during the ongoing legislative process.

To show the current tensions and legal uncertainties concerning TDM, the article presents smart disclosure systems (SDSs) as a case study of AI innovation that requires improved access to data. SDSs refer “to the timely release of complex information and data in standardized, machine readable formats in ways that enable consumers to make informed decisions” (Sunstein, 2012). From a methodological point of view, the theoretical analysis of the IP framework, specifically copyright limitations and the TDM exceptions as discussed in the Copyright reform, will be combined with an empirical research on Terms of Service (ToS) of a representative set of online platforms to understand how private ordering is restricting users’ rights concerning TDM-related activities, including the use of SDSs.

Regarding SDSs, we argue that consumer and data protection legislations can serve as a last line of defence against statutory, contractual and technological limitations to TDM. In fact, both Consumer Protection Laws (namely the Directive on Unfair Terms and the Consumer Rights Directive) and the GDPR framework underline the necessity to give consumers clear, intelligible and legible information. Considering the smart tools now available, the principle of transparency enshrined in consumer and data protection laws has to be interpreted as including a right to “machine legibility”, i.e. the possibility for a SDS to have access to the pre-contractual information (ToS) and the information related to the processing (privacy policy) in a format processable by the smart system.

## Essential bibliography

1. Busch, C., "The future of pre-contractual information duties: from behavioural insights to Big Data." In Research Handbook on EU Contract Law, edited by C. Twigg-Flesner, 221-240: Edward Elgar, 2016.
2. Caspers, M., and L. Guibault. "Baseline Report of Policies and Barriers of Tdm in Europe." Future TDM, 2016.
3. Geiger, Christophe, Giancarlo F. Frosio, and Oleksandr Bulayenko. "The Exception for Text and Data Mining (Tdm) in the Proposed Directive on Copyright in the Digital Single Market – Legal Aspects." Centre for International Intellectual Property Studies (CEIPI) Research Paper No. 2018-
4. Helleringer, Geneviève, and Anne-Lise Sibony. "European Consumer Protection through the Behavioral Lens." Columbia Journal of European Law 23, no. 3 (2017): 607-49.
5. Hilty, Reto, and Heiko Richter. "Position Statement of the Max Planck Institute for Innovation and Competition on the Proposed Modernisation of European Copyright Rules Part B Exceptions and Limitations (Art. 3–Text and Data Mining)." (2017).
6. Margoni, Thomas, and Martin Kretschmer. "The Text and Data Mining Exception in the Proposal for a Directive on Copyright in the Digital Single Market: Why It Is Not What Eu Copyright Law Needs." CREATE Blog (25 april 2018).
7. Stamatoudi, I.A. "Text and Data Mining." In New Developments in Eu and International Copyright Law, edited by I.A. Stamatoudi, 251-82: Wolters Kluwer, 2016.
8. Strowel, A., "Reconstructing the Reproduction and Communication to the Public Rights: How to Align Copyright with Its Fundamentals." In Copyright Reconstructed Rethinking Copyright's Economic Rights in a Time of Highly Dynamic Technological and Economic Change, edited by P. Bernt Hugenholtz: Wolters Kluwer, 2018.
9. Sunstein, C. "*Informing Consumers through Smart Disclosure*", <https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/blog/2012/03/30/informing-consumers-through-smart-disclosure>, 2012 (accessed August 28, 2018).
10. Triaille, J.P., J. de Meeûs d'Argenteuil, and A. de Francquen. "Study on the Legal Framework of Text and Data Mining (Tdm)." European Union, March 2014.